

REMARKS

Claims 1-18 remain in the application and claims 1 and 11 have been amended hereby.

Reconsideration is respectfully requested of the rejection of claims 1-18 under 35 USC 103(a), as being unpatentable over Ball et al. in view of Suzuki, Yoshioka, and Freeny, Jr.

Features of the dubbing system according to the present invention are a control unit for generating data for imposing payment based on a user ID, a dubbing speed selected by a user, and a copyright holder ID read from a control data storage region (TOC) of a first recording medium. See the first paragraph of page 9 of the present application, for example.

Independent claims 1 and 11 have been amended to recite these features of the present invention.

It is respectfully submitted that the combination of Ball et al., Suzuki, Yoshioka, and Freeny, Jr. fails to show or suggest at least imposing payment based on a user ID, a dubbing speed selected by a user, and a copyright holder ID read from a control data storage region (TOC) of a first recording medium.

Ball is cited in this Office Action as describing imposing payment based on a copyright holder ID read from the first recording medium.

It is respectfully submitted that Ball is reading copyright information encoded on video frames of coded audio information and not reading from a control data storage region (TOC) of the


first recording medium such as in the presently claimed invention. See page 3, lines 5-20 of Ball, for example.

Accordingly, and because there are no features in Suzuki, Yoshioka, and Freeny, Jr. that somehow could be combined with Ball and result in the presently claimed invention, it is respectfully submitted that amended independent claims 1 and 11, and the claims depending therefrom, are patentably distinct over Ball in view of Suzuki, Yoshioka, and Freeny Jr.

The prior art made of record and not relied upon has been reviewed and is not seen to show or suggest the present invention as recited in the amended claims.

Favorable reconsideration is earnestly solicited.

Respectfully submitted,  
COOPER & DUNHAM LLP

  
Jay H. Maioli  
Reg. No. 27,213

JHM/PCF:tb  
encl.